

**Methodological recommendations
for carrying out
external review**

Moscow, 2021

Contents

1. GENERAL PROVISIONS	3
2. NORMATIVE AND LEGAL BASIS OF THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW	5
3. PROCEDURE OF SELECTING EXPERTS FOR EXTERNAL REVIEWS, PREPARATION FOR THE EXTERNAL REVIEW	9
4. PECULIARITIES OF CONDUCTING THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW	11
<i>4.1. External review with a site visit</i>	<i>11</i>
<i>4.2. External review without a site visit</i>	<i>11</i>
<i>4.3. External review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies.....</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>4.4. External review of study programs delivered with the use of a network form ..</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>4.5. External review of basic study programmes delivered by educational standards, established by the educational organization on an independent basis.....</i>	<i>13</i>
5. PROCEDURE FOR CONDUCTING THE EXTERNAL REVIEW (EXPERT PANEL WORK)	14
<i>5.1. Preliminary analysis</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>5.2. Carrying out external review with a site visit to the educational organization or its branch.....</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>5.3. Carrying out external review without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch</i>	<i>20</i>
<i>5.4. Carrying out external review in an e-form</i>	<i>21</i>
6. REPORTING DOCUMENTATION	23
7. PROCEDURE FOR MAKING THE DECISION ON STATE ACCREDITATION, REFUSAL OF STATE ACCREDITATION	25

These methodological recommendations for conducting external review (hereinafter – Recommendations) shall help expert panel members in carrying out external review.

The Recommendations are developed in accordance with the legislation on education in the Russian Federation in force as of 01.11.2021.

1. GENERAL PROVISIONS

In accordance with Article 92 of the Federal Law of December 29, 2012, № 273-FL “On Education in the Russian Federation” (hereinafter – the Federal Law on Education), state accreditation of educational activities in basic study programs implemented as provided by the Federal State Educational Standards (hereinafter – FSES), except of study programs of pre-school education, including as provided by educational standards.

The purpose of state accreditation of educational activities is to confirm the compliance with the FSESs of educational activities on basic study programs (hereinafter - BSP) and students’ training in educational organizations (hereinafter EOs) and organizations providing training.

State accreditation of educational activities is carried out according to the external review results.

The subject of external review is to determine the compliance of the content and quality of students’ training in the organization carrying out educational activities in the study programs declared for state accreditation with FSES. During external review of educational activities in study programs implemented in accordance with educational standards, external review of the content of students’ training is not conducted.

Principles of carrying out external review:

- objectivity;
- responsibility of experts and (or) expert organizations for the conduct and quality of external review;
- competence and independence of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations.

Principle of objectivity of external review. External review is conducted on the basis of documents and materials submitted by the educational organization and verified by experts during external review, interviews (survey) with students and teaching staff of the organization on their satisfaction with the quality of education and educational activities.

Principle of the experts’ responsibility for the conduct and quality of external review. As a result of the work in the educational organization, each

expert panel member draws up a report on external review of the study programs he/she is responsible for. In the report, he/she makes a conclusion on compliance (non-compliance) of the content and quality of students' training with the relevant FSES requirements in the relevant integrated group of professions, specialties and fields of training (hereinafter referred to as IGSFT). The experts' reports are the basis of the expert conclusion that is reviewed by the accreditation body when making a decision on state accreditation. Experts are responsible for the quality of external review as provided in the current legislation and agreements on carrying out external review concluded with the accreditation body.

Principle of the experts' competence. Experts and (or) expert organizations carrying out external reviews shall have the necessary qualifications in study programs declared for state accreditation and their qualification shall meet the established requirements.

The qualification requirements to experts and expert organizations, the procedure for the selection of experts and expert organizations to conduct external review are established by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia № 556 of 20.05.2014.

Experts and expert organizations cannot be in civil law relations (experts also cannot be in employment relations) with the EO during external review of its educational activities.

When carrying out state accreditation of educational activities in BSP, the accreditation body considers the expert panel's conclusion and makes a decision on granting state accreditation or on the refusal of state accreditation of educational activities in the relevant BSP in respect of each level of professional education for each IGSFT, which include the BSPs declared for state accreditation.

When making a decision on state accreditation, in accordance with Part 19 of Article 92 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" the accreditation body issues a certificate of state accreditation (hereinafter - the certificate) that is valid for 6 years for the organizations carrying out educational activities to implement basic professional study programs.

In case of refusal of state accreditation, the EO has the right to resubmit the application not earlier than a year after it.

2. NORMATIVE AND LEGAL BASIS OF EXTERNAL REVIEW

1. The Federal Law of 29.12.2012 № 273-FL “On Education in the Russian Federation”.
2. Federal Law of 27.07.2006 № 152-FL “On Personal Data Protection”.
3. Federal Law of 27.07.2006 № 149-FL “On Information, information technologies and information protection”.
4. Federal Law of 28.03.1998 № 53-FL “On Military obligation and service”.
5. Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 18.11.2013 № 1039 “On state accreditation of educational activities” (with the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities).
6. Order of the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science (hereinafter referred to as Rosobrnadzor) of 23.07.2021 № 1052 “On approval of the administrative regulation of Rosobrnadzor’s providing the public service of state accreditation”.
7. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 20.05.2014 № 556 “On approval of qualification requirements to experts and expert organizations, procedures of their certification, inter alia the maintenance of the Register of experts and expert organizations, selection of experts and expert organizations for external review”.
8. Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 24.04.2013 № 370 «On approval of service fee for experts and expert organizations and expense reimbursement incurred at the time of external review».
9. Order of Rosobrnadzor of 14.07.2018 № 809 “On setting the labor expenditures standard and ratios influencing the level of work difficulty depending on the number of students at the educational organization in the study programs declared for state accreditation”.
10. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 22.09.2014 № 1273 “On approval of the procedure for inclusion of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations in the expert panel when carrying out external review of professional study programs, containing information constituting a state secret and delivered by an educational organization under the jurisdiction of the federal executive authority in the field of security, the federal authority responsible for the development and implementation of state policy, normative legal regulation, control and supervision in the sphere of state protection, communication for the needs of public authorities, the federal authority responsible for the development and implementation of the state policy and normative legal regulation in the sphere of defense, the federal executive body responsible for the elaboration and implementation of the state policy and normative legal regulation in the sphere of

internal affairs, the federal executive power body responsible for working out state policy, normative legal regulation, control and supervision in the field of distribution of narcotic drugs, psychotropic substances and their precursors, as well as counteracting their illicit trafficking.”

11. Order of Rosobrnadzor of 20.08.2021 № 1009 “On approval of the application forms for state accreditation of educational activities, on reissuing the certificate of state accreditation and /or its annex (annexes), on issuing a temporary certificate of state accreditation, on provision of a duplicate of the state accreditation certificate, a form of information attached to the indicated applications, and requirements for their completion and registration”.

12. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 5.04.2017 № 301 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – Bachelor’s, Specialist and Master’s programs.

13. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 19.11.2013 № 1258 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – Residency programs.

14. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 19.11.2013 № 1259 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – study programs of training the academic staff in (military) postgraduate education”.

15. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 14.06.2013 № 464 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of secondary vocational education and training”.

16. Order of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation of 09.06.2020 № 609 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on assistantship study programs including the admission procedure on study programs of higher education – assistantship study programs”.

17. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 18.11.2013 № 1245 “ On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education – Bachelor’s Master’s and Specialist approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2013, № 1061, to the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees ratified by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.09.2009 № 337, to the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding a person a Specialist’s degree approved by the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 30.12.2009 № 1136.”

18. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 10.01.2014 № 4 “On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education - training of highly qualified personnel on residency and internship programs approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2013 r. № 1061, to the specialties of specialists with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education in the sphere of health care of the Russian Federation, specified in the nomenclature approved by the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation of April 23, 2009, № 210n, to the fields of training (specialties) of postgraduate vocational education for students in the form of assistant-internship ratified by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on February 22, 2012, № 127”.

19. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.02.2011 № 201 “On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding the qualifications (degrees) of "Bachelor" and "Master", and approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 17, 2009, № 337, fields of training (specialties) of higher professional education, confirmed by awarding a person the qualification (degree) of "specialist", the list of which was approved by the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation № 1136 of December 30, 2009, to the fields of training (specialties) of higher professional education specified in the All-Russian Classifier of Specialties on Education OK 009-2003, adopted and enacted by the Decree of the State Committee of the Russian Federation on Standardization and Metrology from September 30, 2003, № 276-st.”.

20. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 13.07.2016 № 857 “On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education used in the implementation of Master’s and specialist programs containing the data constituting state secrets or proprietary information of limited distribution the list of which was approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2009 №,1060, to the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding a "Master’s” qualification (degree) used in the implementation of study programs of higher professional education containing the data constituting state secrets or proprietary information of limited distribution the list of which was approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of June 28, 20010 №731, and to the fields of training (specialties) in higher professional education confirmed by awarding a "Specialist” qualification (degree) and approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of December 30, 20010 №1136”.

21. Order of Rosobrnadzor of 01.07.2021 № 906 “On approval of the list of documents and materials necessary to carry out an external review with (or without) a site visit to an educational organization or its branch”.

22. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2016 № 1386 “On approval of the rules of procedure for experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations when carrying out the external review”.

23. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.01.2017 № 24 “On approval of the forms of the external review report and the conclusion made by experts and (or) expert organizations, compiled on the external review results”.

24. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 23.08.2017 № 816 “On approval of the procedure for application of e-learning forms and on-line educational technologies by educational organizations when delivering study programs”.

Useful links

Official Internet-portal of legal documents

<http://pravo.gov.ru/>

Model basic programs of general education

<http://fgosreestr.ru/>

Model basic study programs of secondary professional education

<https://fumo-spo.ru/>
(since 2019)

FSES portal

<http://fgosvo.ru/>

Professional standards

[http://
profstandart.rosmintrud.ru/](http://profstandart.rosmintrud.ru/)

3. PROCEDURE OF SELECTING EXPERTS FOR EXTERNAL REVIEWS, PREPARATION FOR EXTERNAL REVIEW

In order to conduct external review, the accreditation body nominates experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations from the Register of experts and expert organizations posted on the Information system of state accreditation (hereinafter ISSA) by means of an automated random selection using the following parameters:

a) the level of education (for general education), IGSFT (for professional education) in respect of which the expert (expert organization) is certified to conduct external review;

b) the place of residence or place of stay of the expert (location of the expert organization);

c) if nominating an expert (expert organization) for carrying out external review of basic study programs containing the information constituting a state secret: the expert's access (admission) to work with official information, as well as with the information constituting state secrets; the expert organization's license to work using information constituting state secrets of the corresponding level of classification;

d) when carrying out external review in the e-form - a qualified electronic signature (hereinafter – e-signature) obligatory for the expert.

The expert panel consists of:

- head of the expert panel appointed from the members of the expert panel in accordance with professional and personal competence;

- experts, representatives of expert organizations with professional competence corresponding to the field of BSPs declared for state accreditation.

Certified international experts with the necessary qualifications in the field of BSPs declared for state accreditation in the relevant field of training (specialty) may be involved in external review.

When conducting external review of professional study programs containing the information constituting state secrets implemented by an organization carrying out educational activities, experts must meet the requirements to the experts and (or) representatives of the expert organizations and must be eligible for work with the information constituting the state secret of the corresponding secrecy degree and admitted to it in the established procedure. Experts are guided by the requirements of the Russian Federation Law of 21.07.1993 № 5485-1 "On State Secrets" and the relevant authorities' regulations.

Involvement of experts and (or) expert organizations to conduct external review of study programs delivered by an educational organization and each of its branches shall be implemented in accordance with an executive order on conducting external review and a civil law contract made with them.

The executive order of an accreditation body on conducting external review, which determines the composition of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations (hereinafter referred to as expert panel) shall specify:

- a) full name of the accreditation body;
- b) full name of an educational organization or branch, which are the subject to external review;
- c) begin and end dates of the external review procedure;
- d) full names of experts (or) representatives of expert organizations included into an expert panel (hereinafter referred to as members of the expert panel), indicating the person appointed as the head of the expert panel;
- e) list of study programs assigned to each expert panel member with the indication of the level of education, IGSFT;
- f) full name of the accreditation body officer supervising the expert panel work during the external review procedure and responsible for the review of the expert panel conclusion on the external review results.

The accreditation body's executive order is issued within 30 days upon the receipt of the organization's application and the documents attached for consideration on its merits. Within 3 working days from the date of the order issuance, its electronic copy (the scanned document) is emailed to the educational organization and the head of the expert panel.

After Rosobrnadzor's issuing executive order on conducting external review (in e-form as well), the head and the members of the expert panel get the login and password to the personal accounts in ISSA.

4. PECULIARITIES OF CARRYING OUT EXTERNAL REVIEW

External review can be conducted with or without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch. The procedure for carrying out external review is determined by the accreditation body in accordance with paragraphs 33-35 of the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities.

4.1. External review with a site visit

External review with a site visit to the educational organization is conducted at the address specified in the supplement to the license for carrying out educational activities.

The expert panel use workplaces provided by the educational organization. The workplace must be a separate isolated office room (rooms) ensuring the safety of documents. It must be equipped with access to the Internet and with necessary furniture and other organizational and technical means necessary for work (printer, scanner, copier, stationery) including communications equipment, personal computers with secured access to electronic legal reference systems.

4.2. External review without a site visit

By the decision of an accreditation body, external review is conducted without a site visit to an educational organization or its branch if the study programs declared for state accreditation are delivered by:

- a) a Russian educational organization located outside the territory of the Russian Federation;
- b) an educational organization founded in accordance with the international treaty of the Russian Federation and carrying out educational activities outside the territory of the Russian Federation;
- c) a foreign educational organization carrying out educational activities outside the territory of the Russian Federation;
- d) an organization carrying out educational activities pursuing to get a reissued certificate of state accreditation on the study programs that have not been accredited before, with the exception of study programs containing information constituting state secrets;
- e) an organization carrying out educational activities specified in paragraph 7 of Part 1 of Article 6 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation", with the exception of organizations carrying out educational activities on study programs not accredited before and being granted the state accreditation for the first time, as well as organizations carrying out educational activities on study programs containing information constituting state secrets;
- f) an organization carrying out educational activities with the information on an independent evaluation of the quality of students' training on the study programs declared for state accreditation that is taken into account in the state

accreditation procedure as established by Section V(1) of the Regulations on state accreditation.

External review without a site visit is conducted at the location address of the accreditation body. In case of carrying out external review in an e-form, it is conducted at the expert's place of residence and (or) the expert's place of employment.

4.3. External review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies

When conducting external review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies, an expert panel shall have access to the electronic information-educational environment in order to analyze the students' learning outcomes and determine whether students have an opportunity to comprehensively acquire study programs, regardless of their location.

4.4. External review during state accreditation of educational activities organized in the form of students' practical training

When conducting external review of study programs, the analysis of the compliance of educational activities organized in the form of students' practical training with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standard is carried out taking into account the area of professional activity and (or) the sphere of professional activity established by the corresponding Federal State Educational Standard.

At the same time, when conducting practical training directly in an organization carrying out educational activities, as well as in its structural unit intended for practical training, the expert panel uses Regulations on the structural unit where practical training is organized.

In the case of students' practical training in an organization carrying out activities in the field of the relevant study program, including in its structural unit intended for practical training, on the basis of an agreement concluded between this organization and the organization carrying out educational activities, the expert panel uses the data about such an organization contained in the Unified State Register of Legal Entities, as well as the agreement on students' practical training.

4.5. External review of study programs delivered with the use of a network form

When conducting external review of study programs implemented using a network form of program delivery the analysis of the compliance of the study

programs' structure and their scope, delivery conditions, including staff and logistics provision, results of programs' acquisition with the requirements of Federal State Educational Standards is carried out by the expert panel taking into account core study programs' characteristics (when implementing part of a study program of the corresponding level, type and field of training – taking into account characteristic features of individual subjects, courses, disciplines (modules), practices, other components stipulated by the program) as well as the scope of resources (including logistics and staff provision), provided by the organizations involved in the delivery of study programs in a network form indicated in the agreement on the network form of study programs' delivery.

4.6. External review of basic study programs delivered against educational standards, established by the educational organization on an independent basis

When conducting external review of basic study programs against such educational standards, the expert (the representative of the expert organization) evaluates the quality of students' training in accordance with the level of the implemented study program by analyzing students' learning outcomes.

In accordance with Part 10 of Article 11 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation", the requirements to the conditions for the implementation and results of mastering the BSP specified in the educational standard can't be lower than the corresponding FSES requirements.

5. PROCEDURE FOR CONDUCTING EXTERNAL REVIEW (EXPERT PANEL WORK)

The procedure for the work of experts included in the expert panel during external review is approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2016 № 1386.

When carrying out external review, the expert panel uses:

a) the application and the attached documents specified in paragraphs 8, 9 – 12 of the Regulations on state accreditation;

b) documents and materials received upon the written request of the expert panel (in the case of carrying out external review without a site visit - upon the request of the accreditation body) from the organization in accordance with the list of documents and materials required for conducting external review established by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science;

c) information on the independent evaluation of the quality of students' training in respect of the study programs declared for state accreditation, stipulated by Section V(1) of the Regulations on state accreditation;

d) information on the evaluation results of the quality of students' training as a result of assessing the learning outcomes achieved by them on the study programs declared for state accreditation.

Functions of the expert panel member.

When carrying out external review, a member of the expert panel:

- cooperates with the National Accreditation Agency (hereinafter NAA), receives and analyzes the assignment for external review;

- shows identification documents to the head or other official representative of the organization;

- studies and analyzes the documents and materials necessary for carrying out external review;

- analyzes the documents and materials posted by the organization on its official website;

- carries out external review of the study programs assigned to him/her in the executive order of the accreditation body and the civil law contract concluded with him/her;

- draws up an external review report in the form approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.01.2017 № 24.

Functions of the head of the expert panel

The head of the expert panel is appointed from among the members of the expert panel specified in the accreditation body's executive order on external review. He/she is responsible for the organization and coordination of work during external review. In addition to the functions of the expert panel member, within the framework of organization and coordination of the works on

conducting external review, the head of the expert panel performs the following functions:

- provides the head of the organization with a copy of the accreditation body's executive order on carrying out external review, and also with a copy of the executive order on making changes to the executive order on external review (if any changes occurred) (when conducting external review with a site visit);
- cooperates with NAA, receives and analyzes the assignment for external review in terms of its organization and conduct;
- receives documents and materials necessary for carrying out external review;
- contacts the head of the organization (with a site visit) or the NAA officer (without a site visit) to clarify the working hours of the organization or NAA;
- draws up an external review schedule taking into account the working schedule of the organization or NAA (without a site visit) and the dates of beginning and ending of external review established in the executive order on carrying out external review;
- informs the members of the expert panel and the head of the organization (with a site visit) or NAA (without a site visit) about the external review schedule;
- makes a written request to the organization for documents and materials necessary to conduct external review as specified in the order of Rosobrnadzor of 01.07.2021 №906, and takes them as per the list of contents/ inventory (with a site visit);
- hands over the documents and materials necessary for external review received from the organization (with a site visit) or NAA (without a site visit) to the expert panel members;
- informs the organization's head on the revealed non-compliances of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements (in case of the external review with a site visit) in the established order and in the form of a notice of non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements;
- hands over the documents received from the organization and confirming the elimination of non-compliance (including in the form of an e-document with the e-signature of the head of the organization) to the expert panel members;
- reviews the reports of the expert panel members to draw up an expert panel conclusion in the form established by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of 17.01.2017 №24;
- draws up the expert panel conclusion upon the external review completion, sends this conclusion with the attached reports on external review to NAA within 3 working days after the end of external review, and also within 1 working day from signing the expert panel conclusion, sends the electronic copy of the scanned conclusion to NAA's e-mail (in case of the external review with a site visit).

When carrying out external review of each study program declared for state accreditation, the expert panel shall:

- determine the compliance of the content of students' training (curriculum, schedule, working programs of disciplines (modules), programs of practices, evaluation tools, methodological materials) and conditions of students' training with the FSES requirements;
- determine the quality of students' training, evaluate the degree of students' achievement of the study program learning outcomes, and (or) planned results of training in a discipline (module), practice.

During state accreditation they take into account the information on independent evaluation of the students' training quality on the study programs declared for state accreditation in the organization carrying out educational activities.

The expert panel takes into account the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality in case they have been received by the accreditation body and carried out within 3 years prior to the submission of the state accreditation application. This independent evaluation must be conducted by the legal entities carrying out independent evaluation of the students' training quality in accordance with Article 95.1 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" (hereinafter referred to as organizations), that:

- a) use evaluation tools recommended by the federal educational and methodical associations in accordance with the standard regulations on educational and methodical associations in the education system and/or that have been agreed upon by the Council on Professional Qualifications (if any) when carrying out independent evaluation of the students' training quality;
- b) belong to all-Russian or other associations of employers, associations (unions) or other organizations representing and/or uniting the professional community in the professional sphere;
- c) involve experts with qualifications corresponding to the levels of education and professions, specialties, and fields of training under independent evaluation of the students' training quality.

The expert panel also takes into account the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality received as part of international comparative research in education in accordance with the criteria and requirements of Russian, foreign and international organizations.

The results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality are taken into account during state accreditation in case the information on independent evaluation of the students' training quality is submitted to the accreditation body together with the information on the compliance of the organization that has conducted it, with the requirements specified in paragraph 58(2) of the Regulations on state accreditation.

In case the results of independent evaluation confirm the compliance of the quality training on the study programs declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSESs of BSPs, external review in respect of the quality of students' training is not carried out.

When making the conclusion on the compliance of the content and quality of students' training with the FSES requirements of the relevant BSP declared for state accreditation, the expert uses recommended by NAA indicators of the students' training content and quality meeting the FSES requirements.

5.1. Preliminary analysis

The expert plans the external review procedure in accordance with the executive order of the accreditation body, the assignment for conducting external review, the application of the educational organization for state accreditation of educational activities. The expert makes a preliminary analysis of the information by examining the received package of documents: application for state accreditation, data on the delivery of the BSPs declared for state accreditation, and analysis of the information posted on the official website (if any)¹. The expert can also use information and analytical materials of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (monitoring results of the HEIs' efficiency, monitoring of the graduates' employment, etc.).

Based on the results of preliminary analysis of the information, documents and materials of the EO (its branch), the expert further plans his actions in accordance with the task assigned to him and the dates of the review. The results of preliminary analysis of the information, documents, and materials are verified during external review.

5.2. Carrying out external review with a site visit to the educational organization or its branch

When conducting external review with a site visit to an educational organization or its branch, the members of an expert panel shall show a head or other official representative of the educational organization identity documents, the head of the expert panel shall present a copy of the executive order of an accreditation body on carrying out external review.

The EO or its branch provides members of the expert panel with workplaces with Internet access. The EO's representative responsible for state accreditation of BSP shows the local normative act on his/her appointment.

Apart from the documents mentioned above, the expert panel members conducting an on-site external review of study programs containing information constituting a state secret are admitted to the educational organization or its branch on presentation of the certificate of admission to the information constituting state secrets according to the appropriate form and instructions for

¹ With the exceptions of the programmes containing the information constituting state secret and those under the jurisdiction of the Federal Security Service of the Russian Federation, Federal Guard Service of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Defence of the Russian Federation

the assignment. The experts herewith are guided by the requirements of the Law of the Russian Federation of July 21, 1993, № 5485-1 “On State Secrets” and the relevant departmental Regulations.

The expert panel members shall work in accordance with the working time schedule established by the internal work order regulations of the organization. If necessary, working hours can run counter to these regulations and it must be agreed with the head of the expert panel and the management of the organization where external review is conducted.

The time of the expert panel staying in the EO or its branch is stipulated by the civil law contract and is not less than 3 working days.

The organization provides an expert panel member with documents and materials necessary for external review within two hours after his/her arrival to the organization.

In case the documents and materials are not provided, it shall be registered in the act on non-submission of the documents (hereinafter – the act) in the expert panel member’s report on external review and brought to the expert panel head’s attention.

The EO’s head or its representative must get acknowledged with the act and sign it.

The act shall contain:

- full name of the EO’s head or the authorized representative;
- full name of the expert panel member who requested the documents and materials;
- the date of the request for the documents;
- the list of documents not submitted upon the written request;
- date of the act.

The fact of the non-submission of the documents is registered by the expert panel member in his/her report on external review and by the head of the expert panel in the expert panel conclusion.

The act is attached to the expert’s report on external review.

Documents and materials required for external review shall be submitted by the organization carrying out educational activities for the period corresponding to the period of mastering this study program. These documents and materials can be submitted in the form of an electronic document signed with an electronic signature as established by the legislation of the Russian Federation, including on electronic media.

In case of external review of study programs with no graduates in the current academic year in the organization carrying out educational activities, the documents and materials requested by the expert panel (accreditation body) shall be submitted by the organization for the period of the study program delivery.

It is not allowed to request from the EO the documents and materials which are not included in the list of documents and materials required to conduct external review, established by Rosobrnadzor, and also documents and materials on paper in case they are published on the official website on the Internet or in EO’s electronic systems in the form of the electronic document with the e-

signature of the EO's head. The EO's head is responsible for providing the expert panel with access to such documents as well as for their actuality and reliability.

The expert panel shall have the right to see the original documents and materials posted on the EO's official website on the Internet in order to verify them.

In case of revealing the falsity of the information provided by the EO, the act is drawn up. It contains the following information:

- full name of the EO's head (authorized representative);
- full name of the head and the expert panel member;
- list of documents and materials containing false information;
- description of the false information;
- date of the act.

The act is signed by the expert and the head of the expert panel. The act is presented to the EO's head (authorized representative) and he/she signs it.

The external review procedure includes:

- analysis of the documents and materials submitted by the EO on delivery of the BSPs declared for state accreditation;
- evaluation of the quality of EO's assessment materials for conducting interim and final attestation;
- assessment of the teaching and methodological support of all types of classes (classroom and independent work, term works (projects), etc.) specified in the curriculum;
- assessment of the conditions for the implementation of the BSPs declared for state accreditation: system-wide requirements, staffing, logistical, educational and methodological support of the program;
- assessment of the quality of students' training.

Compliance of the quality of the EO students' training on the BSPs with the FSES requirements is determined by the results of students' testing (results of training and results of BSP mastering) using the EO's assessment materials. If it is the first year of the BSP implementation and no interim attestation has been carried out, the quality of students' training is assessed by means of external review of the assessment materials. During external review of BSPs implemented in accordance with the educational standards established by the educational organization independently, external review in terms of the content of students' training is not carried out.

As part of the assessment of the quality of students' training, the expert panel analyzes the results of professional and public accreditation and also takes into account the results of independent evaluation of the quality of students' training submitted to the accreditation body and carried out by legal entities responsible for independent evaluation of the quality of students' training (in accordance with Article 95.1 of the Federal Law "On Education") 3 years prior to the day of submission of the application for state accreditation. The expert panel also takes into account the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality received as part of international comparative research in education in accordance with the criteria and requirements of Russian, foreign

and international organizations.

In case the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality confirm the compliance of the training quality on the BSPs declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSESs, external review in respect of the quality of students' training shall not be carried out.

In order to analyze the compliance of the EO's electronic information educational environment (EIEE) and electronic library system (ELS) with the FSES requirements, the expert is provided with a login and password to enter the system. The expert checks the compliance of the EIEE functioning with the FSES requirements. In case of non-compliance with the FSES requirements the expert shall draw up acts:

- on the impossibility of access to the EO's EIEE;
- on non-compliance of the EO's EIEE with the FSES requirements in terms of content with the list of the violations found.

Acts are signed by the expert and the head of the expert panel. To the acts, they must attach the screenshots certified by the expert, EO's local regulatory act on the EIEE functioning, and other documents.

If during the on-site external review the expert has identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements, he/she informs the expert panel head about the identified non-compliance.

The expert panel head informs the EO's head or the authorized representative about the identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements.

Within 5 days from the date of receipt of the information on the identified non-compliance the organization carrying out educational activities has the right to take measures to eliminate the revealed non-compliance and provide the expert panel with the documents confirming the non-compliance elimination, including in the form of an electronic document signed by the head of the educational organization.

5.3. Carrying out external review without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch

External review of the content and quality of students' training is conducted without a site visit in cases provided by paragraphs 34-35 of the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities.

When carrying out external review without a site visit, members of the expert panel shall work in accordance with the working time schedule established by the internal work order regulations of NAA. If necessary, working hours can run counter to these regulations and shall be agreed upon with the head of the expert panel and NAA.

The accreditation body requests the EO for the documents and materials necessary for external review in accordance with the order of Rosobrnadzor of 01.07.2021 № 906.

The head of the expert panel receives from NAA's officer the EO's documents and materials by an inventory/list according to the accreditation body request and provide them to the expert panel members.

The expert checks the availability of all documents and materials by the inventory/list. In case the educational organization has provided an incomplete package of documents and materials for carrying out external review, the head of the expert panel draws up an act of non-submission of documents and materials by the educational organization, which should be signed by the head and expert panel members.

The expert (representative of the expert organization) and the head of the expert panel should record this non-submission in the external review report and conclusion.

The act is attached to the expert's report on external review.

The sequence of the expert's actions during external review without a site visit coincides with that one used when conducting external review with a site visit except for the actions impossible to be performed without a site visit to the educational organization.

The expert evaluates the quality of students' training on the BSPs by analyzing students' works and assessment materials submitted by the EO.

If during external review the expert reveals non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements, he/she informs the head of the expert panel about the revealed non-compliance.

The expert registers it in the report on external review specifying the FSES requirement (item) and a list of documents confirming this non-compliance.

Upon completion of external review (the dates are specified in the executive order of the accreditation body), the head of the expert panel draws up a conclusion of experts and/or representatives of the expert organizations based on the experts' reports on external review in the established form.

5.4. Carrying out external review in an e-form

External review in an e-form is conducted without a site visit. Experts (representatives of expert organizations) work with the documents and materials submitted by the EO necessary for external review in their personal accounts in ISSA or using the Internet file exchange services, depending on the scope of documents and data sent from the EO.

The personal account of the head of the expert panel provides access to all the documents and materials submitted by the EO for external review in an e-form, documents drawn up by experts during external review, as well as the opportunity to supervise the experts' work. In case of using third-party services for file exchange, all the experts must have access to all the documents (links to the third-party services) provided by the EO in an e-form.

In his/her personal account in ISSA, the expert (representative of the expert organization) has access to the EO's documents and materials assigned to him/her in accordance with the Rosobrnadzor's executive order on external review in an e-form and in accordance with the assignment on carrying out external review in the e-form.

During external review, the expert panel uses documents, materials, and information provided by the organization for state accreditation of educational activities in accordance with the requirements established by the legislation in education.

When conducting external review in e-form, the expert panel determines the reliability/falsity of the information provided by the organization on each study program delivery. The reliability/falsity of the information provided by the organization is identified by comparing it with the information on the actual implementation of each study program posted on the official website of the organization on the Internet and (or) in the documents and materials received upon request and posted in the personal account of the organization in the ISSA.

During external review in e-form, the expert panel determines the compliance of the BSP content with the FSES requirements by using the documents and materials submitted by the organization in e-form. Compliance of the quality of students' training on EO's BSPs with FSES is determined by the results of distance testing of students (training results and results of mastering the BSP). When carrying out external review of programs implemented by educational standards established by an educational organization independently, external review in terms of the content of students' training is not conducted.

Upon completion of external review, the expert panel members in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization) draw up reports on external review with regard to the BSPs assigned to them, and the head of the expert panel draws up the expert panel conclusion based on the experts' reports on external review. The reports and expert panel conclusion are signed by the members of the expert panel with a qualified e-signature and posted in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization).

If the expert (representative of the expert organization) does not have a qualified e-signature, the scanned copies of the signed reporting documents are posted in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization), and the originals of the reporting documents are sent to NAA by mail.

6. REPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Upon completion of the external review procedure the expert panel's head shall prepare the conclusion based on external review reports drawn up in accordance with the external review findings (hereinafter referred to as external review conclusion), and on the day established in the accreditation body's executive order shall send it to the accreditation body with the external review reports attached.

The forms of the external review report and expert panel conclusion are established by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation.

The external review report shall contain the specification of the content and quality of students' training on the organization's study programs declared for state accreditation, a list of documents and (or) materials reviewed during the procedure of external review and the students' training assessment results together with the methods and tools used for the learning outcomes' assessment.

In case of non-submission of the documents and materials during external review, the act on non-submission of the documents is attached to the external review report.

In case of revealing the non-compliance of the study program with FSES, the report must contain the information on the FSES item/article with which the non-compliance has been identified, as well as a detailed description of the revealed non-compliance. To the report on external review, the expert attaches copies of the EO's documents confirming the non-compliance or copies of documents and materials posted on the official website in the Internet, certified by the e-signature of the EO's head.

If during external review the organization carrying out educational activities has made changes to the documents to eliminate the identified non-compliance, the report shall contain the relevant information and copies of the documents.

In case the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality confirm the compliance of the training quality on the basic study programs declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSESs, external review in respect of the quality of students' training shall not be carried out. The external review report shall contain the information on the results of independent evaluation of the students' training quality.

It is forbidden to include several study programs in one report on external review.

The expert signing the external review report is responsible for its proper completion and reliability of the information.

Upon completion of external review, the expert panel members submit the reports on external review to the head of the expert panel and send the e-copy of the report (scanned copy) to NAA within one working day from the date of the report handing over and post them in the ISSA personal account.

The expert panel conclusion shall contain the following information:

- a) date of the expert panel conclusion;
- b) full name of the educational organization or its branch which were subject

to external review;

c) information on the documents and materials provided by the educational organization or its branch for external review, as well as the information on the drawn-up act on non-submission of the documents (if any);

d) specification of the content and quality of students' training on the study programs declared for state accreditation and information on the identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements (there shall be a note of their elimination during external review if it happened so), or the conclusion on compliance of the content and quality of students' training with the relevant FSES requirements for each study program declared for state accreditation.

The expert panel conclusion is considered negative in case it contains the following information:

a) information on non-submission of the documents and (or) materials to an expert panel member or its head by the organization carrying out educational activities or its branch;

b) information on the revealed and not eliminated non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements on the study programs declared for state accreditation during external review; the non-compliance can concern:

structure of the basic study programs and their scope;

personnel and material and technical conditions of study programs delivery;

results of study programs acquisition.

The external review reports and conclusion with regard to professional study programs containing information constituting the State secret must not contain information constituting the State secret.

Within 3 working days from the receipt of the expert panel conclusion, the accreditation body shall send its copy to an educational organization or hand it with the signed acknowledgment to an authorized representative of the educational organization and shall publish it on the official website in the Internet.

7. PROCEDURE FOR MAKING A DECISION ON STATE ACCREDITATION, REFUSAL OF STATE ACCREDITATION

Based on the expert panel conclusion and the act on external review results, the accreditation body together with the collegial body of the accreditation body (hereinafter – collegial body) shall make a decision on granting state accreditation or refusal of state accreditation.

The collegial body is a permanent body and acts under the provisions approved by the accreditation body. The collegial body members shall be determined by the accreditation body. Decisions of the collegial body shall be registered in a protocol and shall be advisory for the accreditation body.

The accreditation body shall consider the expert panel conclusion and decide whether the content and quality of students' training at the educational organization and at each of its branches correspond or don't correspond to the federal state educational standards with regard to the level of education, integrated groups of professions, specialties and fields of training of each study program declared for state accreditation.

The grounds for refusal of state accreditation of educational activities on the BSPs declared for state accreditation:

- 1) false information identified in the documents submitted by an educational organization;
- 2) negative conclusion of the expert panel.

The decision of state accreditation of educational activities or refusal of state accreditation is published by the accreditation body on its official website in the Internet.

To improve the procedure of state accreditation, upon completion of external review, the NAA officer sends feedback questionnaires to the EO and all the members of the expert panel.